0:00-3:25 Nova

Welcome
I’m Nova Bhattacharya. I am a dancer and choreographer, and the Artistic Director of Nova Dance. I welcome you all here today. Anyone needing ASL interpretation can pin David’s video block so that it is the largest on their screen. You need the “speaker view” selected in the top right corner in order to do this. Thank you to David Kolenda who is providing ASL interpretation for us today.

We are in a strange time - you don’t need me to tell you that. Rituals like birthdays and funerals and weddings are being reimagined and rescheduled. And this moment is no different, as we try to deal with land acknowledgement in this virtual space. My offering to you today is to take a moment to feel the connection of your feet or your chair to the earth, and think about floating the top half of your body to the sky. Take this moment to think about the difference between ritual and routine. How many times have we listened to the words of land acknowledgements in theatres? What are the words that resonate for us now? For me, it’s the caretakers of this land. For me, it's the dish with one spoon treaty. And these ideas and principles that we’ve been enshrining in our lives in the arts. What does it mean to only take what we need? What does it mean to take care of each other? In that spirit and in that intention, I also invoke the idea of the circle and what it means when we all come together as people who are united; as people who all believe that art makes the world a better place.

Structure for today’s Update:
- 15 minute update from Pat Tobin, Director of Arts and Culture Services, City of Toronto
- 15 minute update from Claire Hopkinson, Director and CEO, Toronto Arts Council and Toronto Arts Foundation
- 30 minutes to answer submitted questions.

Thank you again for being here. I am pleased to welcome Pat Tobin, Director of Arts and Culture Services at the City of Toronto to share your update for today.

3:25-23:37 Pat

- Thank you, Nova, thank you David Kolenda for simultaneous ASL interpretation
- Thank you all for taking the time to join this session today
- Our goal in pulling this session together is to provide you as much information as we can about City and TAC operations in what is a rapidly evolving situation
- I will talk about three things: overall City efforts in confronting the COVID-19 crisis; efforts by the City’s Arts
and Culture Services group; and how we will approach recovery planning

- And to also hear from you about the impacts of the COVID-19 crisis on your organizations, colleagues, and audiences as well as get your input on recovery strategies
- As the posters by Dreeem popping up around Toronto have it, we are all in this together
- And our ability to get out of this with as little damage as possible, still knowing there will be damage, will be best accomplished by working together
- I say that knowing that not all of us on this call share the same privileges or security, and that, by and large, the panel on this webinar have security that does not extend to everyone on this call
- There is a duty then, I think, for City efforts in COVID-19 mitigation and later recovery to take into account the most vulnerable parts of the arts sector, especially artists and culture workers from equity-seeking groups
- Judging by the questions received, I expect that this is a theme that we will return to over the course of this afternoon's session

1) City of Toronto response

- I'll first briefly describe how the City is responding, before moving to Arts and Culture Services
- COVID-19 an unprecedented challenge for the City Key
- City is actively allocating resources to areas of highest priority, including public health system and protecting the most vulnerable, like our shelter population
- to help with the financial challenges that Torontonians are experiencing during the crisis, we have taken measures to provide relief on taxes, utilities and fees, but at the cost of significantly reduced revenues for the City
- on the economic side, this is a liquidity crisis, for arts organizations, small businesses, families and workers and we want to provide as much relief as can reasonably be done
- such relief entails deferred or foregone revenue for the City to pay for City services
- yet, to manage the crisis, we have assumed significant new costs associated with protecting people and businesses during the pandemic
- this has meant some difficult decisions for the City,
including a small number of lay-offs related to services that have been discontinued during the crisis, such as closed recreation and cultural centres

- we will need to continue to closely monitor the City’s financial position, knowing that we may face additional tough choices down the road should the pandemic extend for months, not weeks

2) Arts and Culture Services

- I will now turn from the City at large to the work of Arts and Culture Services
- as it relates to City of Toronto cultural grants, we have committed to maintaining all approved payments, and where, possible, expediting payment
- to do so, we are working with both recipients and City Finance staff to demonstrate the clear need for maintaining these investments
- and working through specific instances where organizations that we are funding may have had to cancel events but we still see the need to maintain the original level of investment – to keep organizations afloat, to pay workers, to pay their creditors, etc.
- and to have arts organizations available to play a key role in Toronto’s economic recovery
- we appreciate the efforts of all our clients in supporting this work
- beyond expediting grants, there are a number of other efforts underway with Arts and Culture Services
- Notably, City staff are redeployed to shore up essential services. About 25% of our staff have been reassigned to areas such as homeless shelters, longterm care homes, and 311. Very proud of how City staff are stepping up to fill these critical roles.
- With our remaining staff, we have restructured to work simultaneously on business continuity, new mitigation measures and planning for recovery.
- On mitigation, with the TAC, we helped established the rapid relief fund for artists
- Next, we have focused on mass participation events, working with organizers and public health officials to help events deal with the new reality of COVID-19 and physical distancing
- This work will continue with mitigation measures as well as a key role for cultural events in the recovery phase
We are also helping to support some new digital initiatives, such as tone in arts education, that have the ability to produce revenues for artists and organizations.

Finally, we are very active on advocacy with other orders of government across multiple fronts, including the needs of Toronto's festivals, advocating for increased grants and administrative streamlining, providing information to the federal government on initiatives such as the CERB and the wage subsidy programs, the new loans available from the EDC/BDC, and provincial efforts for tourism recovery.

3) Looking forward to recovery

- What kind of recovery we will have is not yet clear.
- Looking at other jurisdictions, it is likely that it will be a staged recovery – where digital access may precede events at a neighbourhood/small business scale, before the city could move to its next normal and any possibility of mass gatherings.
- Whatever recovery may look like, there are certain principles that we will need to adhere to: maximize the existing strengths of Toronto's cultural sector, such as a growing global brand, its diversity, recent investments in digital transition, and notably generational leadership (LEAN – Celia Smith, Jeanne Lesage, Michele Maheux).
- As we look out over the horizon, we will also be thinking about the Year of Public Art and its potential for the return of public engagement with art in public space.
- On advocacy, we collectively need to think big.
- What's after the CERB? Perhaps, a Universal Basic Income is a reasonable next step.
- Note that history shows that entitlements, once extended, are difficult to retract.
- Most importantly, we cannot allow an erosion of gains made in equity and need to ensure that recovery efforts reach diverse, socially-engaged and community-embedded arts organizations and artists.
- And we need to embed this thinking in our recovery discussions across all levels of governments.
Thank you Pat for outlining the City’s current position and actions, and thank you everyone for taking the time to participate.

It’s hard to believe that it’s just been 3 weeks since our lives have been so unthinkably altered.

And, to start – I want us all to think about any high points we may have experienced in the last 3 weeks, any moments of joy – and I will bet that whatever those high points are for you – they involve the arts.

If there is one thing that disaster clarifies – it is how important the arts are to our lives.

It has also become clear that many artists and arts organizations are nimble – and have responded to this crisis quickly - changing performances, adopting digital platforms, planning for significant change overnight.

But – it is also true that the enormity of the challenge we are facing is far greater than any individual quick thinking can solve – if we are to come through this - we are going to have to work together.

I am going to spend the next ten minutes outlining things that TAC has done and is doing, and things that we are working towards:

Off the top – let me say that as Toronto’s Arts Council – our primary objective is always the wellbeing of Toronto artists and arts organizations, as well as connecting the arts to all Torontonians. That means we will advocate to make sure that Toronto is treated fairly by the country, and that all our advocacy and programming is considered through an equity lens. Now is not the time to lose sight of these values.

Secondly – provisions that TAC has made, that directly affect you, our grant recipients:
- We have committed to you that there will be no penalty exacted on grant recipients who are unable to present their projects or events as a result of COVID. This means that both operating and project grant recipients can proceed on the understanding that there will be no repayment required of previously approved grants. Please consult your TAC program manager if you have questions or would like to discuss your plans.
- We have committed to our annual and multi-year grant recipients that we will accelerate payment of your grant; we are working on the backend of processing payments now, with the objective of being ready to go the moment the funds are released by the City into our account.
- For all 2020 project applicants: we are committed to continuing with grants assessments and programs for 2020;
however, we will only fund projects that are feasible given COVID – applicants will be given the opportunity to revise applications accordingly.

- Finally, for the vulnerable individual artists among your organizations – we have partnered with Toronto Arts Foundation to deliver the TOArtist COVID-19 Response Fund. I am pleased to say that almost 1,200 applications have been submitted into the fund to date, and the first 192 notifications of approval were sent out yesterday; funds will arrive in those artists’ accounts by the end of this week. I want to thank the City of Toronto for their role in helping us process this unprecedented number of requests. Please note, that due to unprecedented demand we have now suspended the fund to new applications (although we will allow any applicants in process to complete and submit their application). The Foundation is continuing to accept donations to the fund to support applications already received.

Other TAC actions:
- As is the case in any crisis – timely and accurate information is critical; to that end, TAC has created a COVID-19 web portal with web pages devoted to
  o TAC Announcements
  o Public Health resources
  o Public Funders and agencies resources
  o Data Tracking Tools
  o Emergency Funding Support,
  o Art Activations
- We are also sending out COVID Update Bulletins every couple of days to bring news and information updates into your inboxes.

Looking to our broader role:
- TAC will work with arts advocates locally, provincially and federally.
- The focus right now is on federal advocacy and TAC has sent a letter to Federal Ministers advocating support for Toronto artists and arts organizations, a copy is on our web site;
- We will continue to follow up, focusing on
  o The eligibility of artists for the Canadian Emergency Response Benefit (CERB) – in particular getting clarity on the requirement for 0 employment income
  o The eligibility of arts organizations for the 75% Canadian Emergency Wage Subsidy (CEWS) – again ensuring that neither the requirement for a 30% drop in funding nor the exclusion of public bodies, exclude arts organizations from participating
  o The establishment of an Arts relief fund to be directed to non-profit arts organizations
- Paying particular attention to the position of Toronto organizations within any national funding program
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>38:50-40:44</th>
<th>Nova</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thank you Pat and Claire.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On behalf of everyone who has gathered, I can extend thanks to the Toronto Arts Council for your swift response and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
communications with all of us. Knowing how much trust the Council has in us as artists and arts organizations helps bolster us as we try to navigate the current landscape. It’s wonderful to hear what you need from us as we move forward and the spirit of collaboration that’s being extended across all networks. At this moment in time, artists keep saying “this is the moment we’ve been training for. We’re improvisers, we’re agile, we’re nimble, we’re creative” and yet we need to find a way to sustain ourselves in this moment. To be able to have this conversation with the City and the Council is very important.

We received 35 very thoughtful questions from you, many of which of course were duplicated. We have grouped them into 10 separate topics and will do our best to get through them all.

We’ve ordered these to start with the most popular subject areas.

1) The most asked question was about the possibility of additional funding to assist arts organizations through this or an arts relief fund. In particular, Bengt Jorden asked “Will there be any specific support for Toronto Arts Organizations? If yes, how will you ensure a fair distribution?”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>40:44-44:40</th>
<th>Pat &amp; Claire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Pat:        | Looking back at other crisis and recovery efforts that have included stimulus spending, frequently they’re focused on large public events and tourism draw as well as cultural infrastructure. So those are two things that we should bear in mind immediately. The festival sector is quite volatile, given the rise of public safety costs and a number of other factors. At the city, we want to shore up third party event producers to take advantage of what might come. Anyone with a cultural infrastructure plan, now is the time to talk to colleagues and to scale that into a proposal, should cultural infrastructure money come online. With respect to increased operating grants, the City will not likely be in a position to expand operating grants significantly. This is where Claire was talking about focusing on advocacy to the province targeting organizations, and we will also do so with the Federal government. I put into context the City’s financial position earlier in the call; we will do everything in our ability, but we face a different set of constraints than the other governments do. We think a lot of our effort should go into trying to convince the other governments to contribute. To the second part of the question, about equitable distribution, we’ve talked a lot about the need to not backslide on equity. We also need to think about how to future-focus the sector. There will need to be a lot of deliberate thought about what criteria
go into distributing funds rather than layering over what already exists.

Claire:
Advocacy, particularly on the federal level, is really important. To make sure that we are educating and informing any relief programs as to the nature of the highly diverse arts sector in Toronto and how unique and valuable each and every member of the sector is to the vitality of the City. We will be there and will have our colleagues at our side reinforcing that message. I just saw a note from Kate Cornell coming through about how every organization should really apply for the 75% wage subsidy (CEWS). That is a very valuable point, because the more applications that come in from the arts community to these general sector-wide funds, the more education there will be as to the unique nature and circumstances in our field. Sometimes it is the anecdote and the particular which really helps to inform those redesigning programs. In essence, this is something which is all of our work; no one person can ensure that. It is something that we all have to do together, to ensure that our value is understood here in Toronto.

| 44:40-45:02 | Nova | 2) The second most asked question was about the possibility of rent relief, deferral, etc. Amy Gottung phrased it: “Is anything underway to protect / forgive rent for creative spaces (collective or private studios, venues, etc.) during COVID?” |
| 45:02-47:00 | Pat | The short answer is yes. The City worked with the province immediately to move on the suspension of sheriff notices that stopped evictions for a while. There is an effort as well to shore up a number of City financial support systems for renters; rent bank etc. A lot of them intersect with Ontario Works. You should take a look at the city website for those. You can imagine the demand on those right now so I don’t want to over-sell those. The mayor has gotten out front trying to use whatever persuasion he can generate from his office to compel landlords to not evict either commercial or residential tenants, and that work continues. Claire mentioned part of the provincial advocacy, which also relates to a rent relief fund which could be targeted. This question came from Amy at Long Winter, and Long Winter has been doing some really interesting work with counterparts in France on structural responses to this. We need to redouble those efforts. We need to figure out how we capture the value that’s being generated in cities by artists and creative organizations so we can ensure, at the very least, that they have accessible and affordable spaces going |
forward. For the city, there is going to be a big focus on trying to change the fundamental structure of how we allocate space to creative organizations. Unfortunately no cheques out the door for renters, but a lot of work to try to figure out how best to stabilize the situation and then find funds available to commercial and residential relief.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Text</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>47:00-47:22</td>
<td>Nova</td>
<td>3) Several of you wanted to know about the eligibility of artists to apply for CERB. Sylvie Bouchard asked “Will the emergency fund from the government ($2,000/month) allow people to have some revenue during that time?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47:22-48:56</td>
<td>Claire</td>
<td>This is a remarkable opportunity and you should take advantage of it. Every artist who can, should take advantage of this program. If somehow you don’t fit into the criteria for this program, please let us know why so that we can feed that information upstairs. This program is still going through several iterations. The Prime Minister recently acknowledged that they are working through various details; that they are not insensitive to the issues of gig workers and they may provide some changes to the plan to allow for those anomalies in the gig economy. Again, let us know what difficulties you have, but this is a really exceptional opportunity for artists and arts workers. You are also able to continue working while you receive these funds. The government will still underwrite your income to the tune of $2000 /month. Please read our bulletins - as soon as we get more clarification on this program we will post it in our bulletins.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48:56-49:15</td>
<td>Nova</td>
<td>4) There were also several questions about grants from the city. Jackie Santos of Mural Routes asked “When can we expect to hear about City of Toronto grants and whether we have been approved or not?” And, Steve Lusk asked “How has the funding for Public Art been affected?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49:15-51:50</td>
<td>Pat</td>
<td>Much like the TAC, we are working to expedite our grants. For some instances where the activities for which the applicant applied are no longer taking place, we are just answering some questions around that (with the intention still to move the money out as quickly as we can). With Mural Routes, that’s a grant under the Cultural Hot Spot program and the SPARK initiative and those are heading out the door. We operate on a rolling set of deadlines so there are some, like the indigenous arts and culture partnerships fund, that have a May 16 deadline so those will be playing out in the future. Year Of Public Art funding has not been impacted. There was $1M allocated in the city’s budget 2020 for the Year of Public Art, which was to be seed funding for organizations to ready projects to come online in 2021 to compliment the money for the TAC’s Animating Toronto Streets program. If folks saw the media</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
reporting over the weekend following the Mayor’s press conference on Friday, the city is in the negative to the tune of $65M/week right now. Again, that is a combination of collapsed revenues and rising expenditures. What that means is that we need to figure out exactly how we shore up the financial resources necessary to manage through the emergency. There are questions being asked of “can people defer expenditures?” as you are asking yourself in your own organization. Cultural grants compose a small portion of the City’s $13B budget, and so thus far there is an understanding that it’s very important to move those out because again that money goes into the economy, helps people stay employed, and helps organizations stay afloat. For Year Of Public Art we will be looking to move that money more in the third quarter of our fiscal year that starts in June, but it will be used for the same purposes. Whether or not we need to shift some of that forward to give the city more breathing space in the 2020 fiscal year, that may come to pass. But none of that money has been committed to individual organizations.

51:50-52:11 Nova

5) Again, a number of you asked about recovery plans, much of it tied to future marketing. Specifically Jacoba Knaapen asked “How does the city intend to FACILITATE and ENSURE a holistic cross-sectoral marketing plan that will serve to attract audiences?”

52:11-53:45 Pat

The cultural sector is going to feature prominently in recovery although we don’t yet know the nature of that recovery. Sometimes it’s easy for us in Toronto to look at SARS and try to pull lessons from that, whereas SARS was a really different thing and had an international dimension. That isn’t necessarily the case in COVID-19 which is playing out quite similarly across the globe. So marketing will be different. It’ll be less destination marketing that was a feature of SARS and will be more set within the context of whatever public health guidance we have at the time, encouraging Toronto to re-emerge from our collective isolation and to re-engage with ourselves and with each other as neighbours. There will be a lot of conversation post-crisis about social cohesion and about the community’s return to normal; the arts have a critical role to play in that. So regarding marketing, this is all really speculative, but we’ll follow the best advice of the sector. It feels a bit premature to speculate beyond that but it also does feel like we will move through phases that are first digital, second smaller-scale to focus on small business, small organization and neighbourhoods. And then maybe move into mass marketing outside of Toronto where you are looking at greater movement of people across borders.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Transcript</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 53:45-54:35| Nova   | 6) Charles Smith wants to know “What type of support will the TAC provide, if any, for racialized arts groups that do not have core funding”  
Nova: that’s referring to individuals and organizations that have faced historic inequities and newer, smaller organizations may not have the reserves needed to survive these situations. What is the TAC looking at in terms of approaches to this issue? |
| 54:35-56:10| Claire | At this point we have been working very hard and making some progress in dealing with historical inequities. Certainly with TAC’s equity framework we are focusing on issues of equity and inclusion. In our most recent grants statistics over the last year we can see significant improvement for equity priority groups in accessing TAC funding, to a significant degree. Over 50% of funded project grants are going to equity priority groups. TAC does not have any new funding to put in new programs at this moment. As we’ve talked about earlier, the new funding that we have to look for is from Federal and Provincial sources as the city will not have a lot of new funding. Advocacy is going to be critically important. I assure you that equity and inclusion is one of the most important issues when we are talking to Federal and Provincial counterparts, making sure that whatever relief funds there are take these issues into consideration. |
| 56:10-56:50| Nova   | 7) There were a few questions on assistance with Organizational management and direction: Eric Stein of Ashkenaz asked “Should we continue to wait and see how things play out, or would we be wisest to cut losses now and cancel our festival (sept 1-7)?” And, Kayla McGee of the Music Gallery asked “What direction do we have in paying out contracts to artists and production crew for cancelled performances?” |
| 56:50-58:29| Claire | This is another important question that we are wrestling with as well. Essentially, we will trust arts organizations to make these decisions as best they can. Working with your board of directors, thinking about the relationships you have with your stakeholders, your artists, your vendors. What is going to prepare you in the best way for recovery? TAC cannot give a one-size-fits-all answer to this, but if you are struggling with answers to these questions I think it’s fantastic that LEAN has been started. Also, other arts organizations who have already thought through these issues can share their best practices. Ultimately I believe that we can trust in the values of the arts community as you navigate through these very difficult decisions. We know that these decisions are taken with great thought and care. It is important to balance your relationships and your need to prepare yourself for recovery. |
8) A couple of questions came in about tax policy and the specific challenges of charities; Ben Coleman of TSO asked “about the City's interest in helping to advocate for increased charitable donation tax credits”

This is a fantastic idea. I first heard about it at the Mayor’s Arts & Culture Roundtable and we immediately put it into our letter to the Federal Minister. The idea is that we should be looking at enhanced tax credits through to the end of 2021, but there was also a proposal that donations made in 2020 up until taxes are filed, should be taxed at a rate of 2019, before the market crashed. We will continue to advocate for this. This is where your board of directors, who may have friends in high places, can say that this is one of the better solutions to help organizations. Not only is there a loss of box office, a loss of in-kind income as well as extraordinary expenses, but there is also a market downturn and potentially a downturn in donations. We need to collect this data so that we can report out on what the impact is in the sector. Thank you Ben for that question - I encourage you all to take that suggestion and put it forward!

9) Lila Karim of North York Arts asked about data tracking, “Will the results from the various arts impact surveys be aggregated? And shared at a later date?”

Yes. Echoing Claire’s thanks particularly to the arts service organizations who have really taken a lead. She mentioned Arts Pond, the Canadian Coalition for the Arts, and TAPA - their work needs to be aggregated. Claire made reference to TAC's work on this, which can go out to the donor community to try to get a read from that side of what's actually going on with pledges. We are seeing stuff anecdotally from the sector. Canadian Heritage has struck a COVID-19 recovery group that we are in touch with. They will be working closely with Canada Council for the Arts and we are going to feed things in to be able to aggregate this impact analysis. We are also comparing notes with other cities as they pull in their information. Finally, we absolutely commit to sharing it back in real time. We need to do this in order to be able to track accurately who is most vulnerable. Recovery will not be a one-size-fits-all solution, as Charles and others have pointed out. We will need to use the impact data to inform investment strategies to keep the sector intact as well as ensuring that the most vulnerable parts of it are held strong coming out of recovery.

10) And, finally, Amy Calder asked “How can culture be used to support people's mental health and wellbeing as a relief during COVID-19 and during recovery?”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Statement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1:02:28-1:04:19 | Claire | This is one of the good-news stories that we are seeing on the news and in social media these days; how the arts are helping people cope, helping lift people's spirits, singing from balconies - it’s quite amazing. Tracking what is being done will really help with our advocacy efforts going forward. On a practical level, TAC’s COVID-19 web pages have a “health resources” section with many resources for mental health. We will also continue to collect stories about how the arts are helping people with their mental health issues. We know from our arts organizations that some wonderful work is being done on a year-round basis. We need to capture those stories and make sure that people understand that as well as we can.  

I know we are out of time so I want to take another moment to say thank you to Pat, to David, to Nova, to the team for helping us put this together. But most of all - to all of you (I wish I could see your faces) for the incredible work you are doing. I believe that we are a very strong community when we work together. I can see from the chat room, how people are populating it with links and advice. This is the best of our community and I believe this is why we are going to weather through this particular storm. |
| 1:04:19-0:00:00 | Nova   | The collaborative spirit that artists and arts organizations are exhibiting at this time are a tremendous model for politicians and leaders in many other sectors to look to. There is a strong sense that there is something that is breaking apart - a system, a sector, an economy that wasn’t quite working for everyone - and it feels like the most urgent question right now might be “is it our intention to rebuild as it was or to rebuild in a way that is more equitable, more creative and more resilient?” We need our commitment to the arts community and to our audiences - to the public that our art is supposed to be speaking to - to serve with our art. How can we all be better versions of ourselves and to commit our resources to the future? Finally, in closing, I would invite everyone again to return to the beginning. To take a moment to feel connected to the land and think about what was, what is right now, and what will be. I think that all of us working together means that we will have a promising and hopeful future. Thank you. |