

Transcript

Re: **City of Toronto Arts and Culture Services and Toronto Arts Council Digital Update** with MP Julie Dabrusin and Toronto Budget Chief Gary Crawford, May 14, 2020

Time	Who	Item
00:00 - 04:27	Nova	<p>Welcome everyone - I'm Nova Bhattacharya. Past President of Toronto Arts Council, and the Artistic Director of Nova Dance. I welcome you all here today. David Kolenda will be providing ASL interpretation. You can pin David's video block so that it is the largest on your screen. You will need the "speaker view" selected in the top right corner in order to do this. Thank you to David for working with us today.</p> <p>Today is May 14, 2020. We are living. We are living in the province of Ontario where our State of Emergency has been extended to June 2nd, and the City's cultural venues remain closed until at least June 30th.</p> <p>We are mourning the deaths of hundreds of thousands of people across the globe and grieving the transformation of our humanity into cold statistics. As a community of art makers we are in a highly charged moment – as dancer Jilla Cato of Kashedance has so eloquently stated "we are creating in a time that is actually re-creating us"</p> <p>I invite you now to join me in a moment of connection to the land, to Mother Earth, to acknowledge the traditional territory of the Missisaugas of the Credit, the Anishnabeg, the Chippewa, the Haudenosaunee and the Wendat peoples and to find a deeper meaning in this acknowledgment. Today I'm thinking about the meaning of Haudenosaunee – "People building an extended house" or "People of the Long House" and their metaphoric intention that people are meant to live together as families in the same house.</p> <p>Take a moment to consider how a global pandemic is unravelling the things we know and creating the opportunity for us to rethink and reimagine our future. As difficult as the times are, there is much to give us hope – the leadership you have shown in stewarding your own organisations, the compassion and generosity you are sharing as individual</p>

		<p>artists and the role you are all playing in upholding the essential function of the arts in society. You are inspiring. Also inspiring right now is the fact that the people of this city are having socially distanced street dance parties; and that every night people are expressing the rhythms of their bodies as they beat pots and pans in a ritual of support for health and other essential service providers.</p> <p>A city that feels its heartbeat so deeply is a city that will dance boldly into the future.</p> <p>Structure for today's Update:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 10 minute update from Julie Dabrusin, MP for Toronto- Danforth • 15 minute update from Councillor Gary Crawford and Pat Tobin, <i>Director of Arts and Culture Services</i>, City of Toronto • 10 minute update from Claire Hopkinson, <i>Director and CEO</i>, Toronto Arts Council and Toronto Arts Foundation • 20 minutes to answer submitted questions. <p>Thank you again for being here today. I am pleased to now welcome MP for Toronto-Danforth, and Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister of Canadian Heritage, Julia Dabrusin</p>
04:27 - 10:50	MP Julie Dabrusin	<p>Thank you very much, and Nova thank you for that introduction. That was a really beautiful way to bring us together and to start this off. It has been hard not seeing each other and being kept apart. It's good to have these opportunities to talk using Zoom and all of those technologies, but it's not the same, so it's nice to have those reminders about the connections. I was happy to be invited to be here today so thank you for the invitation. It's a really important chance to catch up and to hear from you about what's happening here in the arts community in Toronto.</p> <p>I was inspired to see how quickly the Toronto Arts Foundation stepped up - pretty much immediately - to help local artists and to really do an amazing job to show that support. Arts and culture is so important to our country and we're having a real moment now where people are recognizing it. It's something that maybe a lot of us on this call already know, but people right now are relying on the arts for entertainment and for solace in a really difficult time.</p>

		<p>I also want to highlight, because it's a part of arts and culture that we don't really talk about enough, that it's also really an important economic driver. It's 3% of GDP in our country. I think it's always important to highlight that part as well as we go forward.</p> <p>The closures have had a very severe impact on our creative industries here in the city and across our country. That has been a focus here and at the federal government level as to how to respond and to provide that support for creative industries.</p> <p>I'm the one talking to you right now but there are a lot of people at their separate homes, at their kitchen tables all across the country who are working within the ministry and the department. We have some of them on this town hall with us and they're also listening. They are putting in tireless hours - right now we have Irene, Richard and Brendan on the line. Just know that there is a whole team out there that is working to come up with the programs to help out the creative industries. Some things happened earlier on to try to speed up what program funding was there: aid to publishers, trying to speed up CAFCO credits, those types of pieces. Also Canada Council is trying to speed up some of its funding at the front end. Over the past week you will have just heard more details about \$500 million that came from the federal government to support the creative industries. That is the part that we should all be looking at right now to have a big impact. The goal of the funding is to keep our organizations going and to help to make sure that workers in the arts industry are supported, particularly those who are freelance and who are self-employed who might not be able to access things like the Canada Emergency Wage Subsidy.</p> <p>It will be coming out in two phases: The first phase is going to existing clients of Heritage and the Canada Council. The reason it's designed that way is to try to get funding out as quickly as possible. The way it's organized, you don't have to apply for it if you're an existing client. They will be reaching out to you, so it's trying to make it as easy as possible and as quick as possible.</p> <p>Phase 2 is going to try to take into account those organizations that aren't existing clients. So there is a second phase that's accounted for within the money that's been allocated. I just wanted to make sure that I give some</p>
--	--	--

		<p>comfort in the fact that there's another phase within the \$500 Million.</p> <p>But people who already are receiving funds through Heritage and Heritage programs through Canada Council, you are part of phase one and will be hearing from us shortly. The goal for that funding is actually to try to get that first wave of funding out by the first week of June. I also want to let you know that these kinds of town halls and all of the feedback that we are getting from artists are really important. It's also where you see tweaks and changes being made to existing programs as we go. For example, with the Canada Emergency Response Benefit, the fact that people could earn up to \$1000 and still receive it, but also that royalties would not be included in that \$1000 - that was all from what we heard from artists and creators who were giving us responses and telling us what was needed. This conversation is really important because it's how we get the information that we need to be able to keep working on the programs to make sure they're responding to the needs on the ground.</p> <p>I know that there will be some time for questions so I'll leave it there, but I wanted to say thank you for including me and to let you know that it's not the end of the conversation when this hour is up. Thank you.</p>
<p>10:50 - 17:41</p>	<p>Councillor Gary Crawford</p>	<p>I also want to thank Nova for your introduction, it was very touching. I think we need this conversation that we are having right now.</p> <p>I've had the opportunity to be a City Councillor for the last 10 years and I've been very involved with Claire and the Toronto Arts Council on their board. I have had the opportunity to see how the creative heart and soul of this city really runs. When we have these challenges, the people who come out to support us at all levels are creative people in the City and we're starting to see that now.</p> <p>Thank you to MP Dabrusin and her colleagues with the federal government for coming out and supporting these measures. That initial \$500M is critical for the culture sector, especially for the cultural workers and the organizations. Thank you to everyone who has participated in the roundables that myself and Mayor Tory have been having. As MP Dabrusin mentioned, it is important that we speak to</p>

		<p>everyone. Just after March the Mayor and I reached out as quickly as possible to many sectors across the city. We wanted to listen, we wanted to hear, and to recognize the challenges. We are starting to develop the processes and everything that we need to do to ensure a safe but economic recovery. These conversations have been critically important.</p> <p>We have heard from dozens of Toronto artists, arts organizations, and culture workers since mid-March as part of the Mayor's Task Force for Economic Support and Recovery.</p> <p>What we heard were the impacts of COVID-19 on you and on everyone else. We also heard that we need to take action, not only from the City's perspective but from the provincial and federal governments. All three levels have to be working well together and I think that you are seeing that when you look at provincial and federal and other municipalities, but specifically Toronto. We are working together and I think that's a really important factor as we move forward.</p> <p>We are about ready to complete the report summarizing all this great advice - and I have to give a hats-off to Pat Tobin for his work on this - this report will be going to a larger task force which will inform where the City is going and the future directions and actions that the City will have to take. The report will be finalized in the next day or two and then sent off to that task force. But we wanted to wait for today's call and yesterday's consultation with the Toronto Music Advisory Committee, so hopefully by the end of today we will have this report finished.</p> <p>Notably, a number of common themes are emerging:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">o Maintain and advance equity gains that are at risk and support vulnerable workers. We heard this over and over again and it will be a big part of the report.o Support culture sector business continuity and key institutions across the whole city. When you're looking at the support, a lot of that is financial and liquidity, but there will be other means of support that we will be looking at for businesses and key institutions.
--	--	---

		<ul style="list-style-type: none">o Significantly improve digital infrastructure and adaptation. Again, as we move forward the city is specifically looking at opportunities for digital transformation. o Leverage culture to support strong neighbourhoods in a healthy multi-centred city. This has been a theme that we continue to have across the City with Toronto Arts Council and many other organizations and work will continue with that. <p>These themes, or something close, will help frame up the report I provide to Mayor Tory. I want to assure you that your voices are being heard. We are listening and acting and that is forming the decisions that we are making right now.</p> <p>Since the last virtual Town Hall, operating grants have gone out to City clients and we are expediting the TAC's funding for grants supporting their clients' 2021 operations and projects. Our support for the arts, by the way, has not changed or waived from my perspective. We are also looking at getting some property tax relief out to music venues.</p> <p>The City remains fully committed to the Year of Public Art going forward in 2021 with more news of that to follow later in spring</p> <p>As you see in the media, the City is dealing with significant financial pressures due to the COVID-19 crisis. We know therefore that the City of Toronto cannot spend our way out of the crisis, so we have to be smart and seek creative solutions and partnerships to bring the best ideas of the sector forward. The province and the federal government are key partners with us. This way we can help Toronto's artists and arts organizations to lead and to help Toronto restart, recover and rebuild the City.</p> <p>I want to thank everyone for coming out today. I appreciate this opportunity to not only hear from you but to speak. We also need to let you know what we're doing. One of the things I'm hearing from not only the arts community but also others in my ward is "What's Happening? We need to know where we're at" And I think that's critically important that we</p>
--	--	--

		<p>give proper information to everyone. And with that I want to thank you so much for the opportunity to be here today. █</p>
<p>17:41 - 24:06</p>	<p>Pat Tobin</p>	<p>I'd like to thank Nova for that incredibly beautiful, and moving open that she brought, and for reminding us what is truly important. I want to thank MP Dabrusin as well. As she and Councillor Crawford have both said, the level of collaboration among funders is better than many of us have seen in years and that's a really good thing. It's also taken this cue from the broader cultural sector which has been collaborating highly effectively on advocacy and joint initiatives like URGNT and others. It's been amazing to watch that.</p> <p>I'm going to touch on a few updates on operations and announcements that have come out in the past few weeks, and then I'll touch on what's up next.</p> <p>By way of operations, you may have seen in the media conversations around city staff working to shore up essential services such as sheltered and long-term care homes. That is something that staff at Economic Development and culture have been doing. I'm really proud of them for doing that challenging and rewarding work. Those redeployments continue and will wind down.</p> <p>I mentioned now that your service levels as clients might have changed. We are trying to ensure that we stay in touch with you even as some of our staff aren't at their desks. We have introduced a newsletter and will try to ensure that we remain available to you.</p> <p>Further to Councillor Crawford's update, the City has made minor reductions in staff. We have had some minor layoffs at EDC for services that were deemed non-essential. For example, if museums are shut and there are staff associated with running those programs. We waited as long as we could, but have taken a step to lay some off, with plans to recall them as soon as we move into the restart and recovery period. I want to recognize as well though that the security available to public sector workers is unavailable to many of the people on this call. I want to also note that, as Councillor Crawford and MP Dabrusin mentioned with respect to the rapid relief fund from the Toronto Arts Foundation, the position and make up of vulnerable workers in this city in the cultural sector has been borne foremost in</p>

		<p>mind by everybody that I'm talking to among funders. Those at the City, certainly Councillor Crawford, in carrying that forward in the task force that he mentioned. Supports for vulnerable workers will absolutely form parts of the responses that we are working on.</p> <p>To note that, as Councillor Crawford said, there is a new Toronto Office of Recovery and Rebuild headed up by Saad Rafi. One of the pillars of that work is a cluster around business, culture and restarts. Effectively around tourism, and recovery of major events. So we will be working to support that and in the coming weeks you will hear more about what their focus will be.</p> <p>In the interim, we continue to work to deliver things that we've been hearing come out of the round tables that people need. Just this Monday we announced a new partnership with Shopify called the shopHERE project. We will circulate that link to folks after this call, but it will allow you to access ecommerce technology and to actually have a website built, so that should hopefully be a benefit to some folks.</p> <p>The Arts@Home initiative is a good example of partnership with the National Ballet School, Prologue for the Performing Arts, Harbourfront and Young Peoples Theatre, among others, who are pulling together a unified platform to make available, particularly to parents who are now suddenly homeschooling, really good arts education material online as a means also of helping these organizations continue to have staff working and continue to promote their content as well.</p> <p>Next up for us is going to be the Creative Co-location Facilities Property Tax Subclasses that Councillor Crawford mentioned. This will be an effort to try to reach live music venues who were among the first to close and who are likely to be among the last to reopen during the crisis. We will be bringing forward a measure to council as soon as we can. Please stay tuned for more on that.</p> <p>With respect to what is next up beyond that, it will be the work of responding to the recommendations Councillor Crawford has just mentioned in the report from the roundtables. He outlined those themes, which will be given to the Mayor this week and will help inform the work of the</p>
--	--	--

		<p>office of Recovery and Rebuild as far as the recovery plan for the Culture sector.</p> <p>We are going to keep talking to you to make sure that as this situation continues to evolve, we hear from you both what your needs are as they evolve and what your recommendations and ideas for recovery measures will be. Further to Nova’s great unpacking of the origins of Haudenosaunee, tomorrow will be a meeting with Indigenous arts leaders who will provide us with really good advice about how to think with a long arc about recovery and what we need to do in the immediate term to take care particularly of the most vulnerable among us.</p> <p>I’ll leave it at that, but thank you all for attending, and thank you to my co-panelists.</p> <p>Hand off to Claire</p>
<p>24:06 - 33:45</p>	<p>Claire Hopkinson</p>	<p>Thank you Nova again for your beautiful introduction as always. And thank you Julie, Gary, Pat and David – and many thanks to everyone on this call for taking the time to participate. It’s great to read some of your comments and questions in the chat room.</p> <p>As we have heard, both the federal government and the City have been working very quickly to respond to the extraordinary circumstances we all find ourselves in.</p> <p>Toronto Arts Council and Toronto Arts Foundation have also been intent on delivering support and assistance as effectively as we can.</p> <p>We know that each one of you has also been responding to this crisis quickly - changing performances, adopting digital platforms, planning for significant change overnight.</p> <p>But it is also true that the enormity of the challenge we are facing is far greater than any individual quick thinking can solve. If we are to come through this well, we are going to have to work together.</p> <p>Off the top – let me say that at Toronto’s Arts Council our primary objective is always the wellbeing of Toronto artists, arts organizations and the citizens of Toronto who enjoy the arts. That means we will advocate to make sure Toronto</p>

		<p>gets fair access to federal and provincial programs and that all our advocacy and programming is considered through an equity and human rights lens. Now is not the time to lose sight of these values.</p> <p>This week we wrapped up our TOArtist COVID-19 Response Fund. I am delighted to report that 932 artists, in fact, every eligible applicant, received funding totaling \$836,347. The fund was launched with \$450,000 from Toronto Arts Council and the Foundation combined, and in a very few weeks individuals, foundations and corporations donated an additional \$386,347 which was enough to meet the immediate need. There are so many remarkable stories in that, and there were donors who came back week after week to keep[on topping up the fund.</p> <p>We are going to continue to work through the foundation to encourage philanthropy and to encourage corporations to keep up their important contributions to the arts sector in Toronto.</p> <p>Also worth noting, Toronto Arts Council and Foundation are working with partners including Ryerson University on two research projects to bring essential support to arts organizations as you all strive to manage in the face of uncertainty.</p> <p>#lights-on brings together key stakeholders to make sense of the current crisis, synthesize and analyse data and impact studies, develop and communicate strategies for support of the sector as it begins to envision the future.</p> <p>Cue to Cue will draft Guidelines for Occupational and Public Health Standards in performance venues during COVID recovery, particularly focused on the back stage and rehearsal end of things.</p> <p>But in addition to working on these programs, what we at the Council and Toronto Arts Foundation and the Foundation have been doing most is listening. Listening to you, as you let us know about gaps that exist within current programs, and suggest new opportunities and visions for the future.</p> <p>This past month, I have sat in on a number of grants assessment meetings where our arts committee members</p>
--	--	--

		<p>have shared their thoughts on issues that can strengthen the arts community and, in particular, advise us on what TAC can do to help.</p> <p>We also recently convened alumni members of our TAC Leaders Lab to ask them these same questions. We will be continuing to find various formats, including today, to convene and consult with the community so that we can listen and push any questions out to find answers.</p> <p>Of course, we have been meeting regularly with our colleagues both federal and local, as well as meeting with other arts councils from across the country to share program plans. We need to learn from others as well as ensure that we are not working across purposes, and also communicating issues that are relevant to Toronto artists and arts organizations.</p> <p>And we have met with our large and growing Advocacy Network to explore how we can work together to most effectively communicate the value of the arts and the specific needs of Toronto’s arts community as it faces the challenges of COVID. This advocacy will of course include communicating the need for additional investment in recovery efforts.</p> <p>As part of these advocacy efforts, we have assembled some data about the contribution that you, our non-profit arts organizations and artists make to our national and provincial non-profit arts sector. Even I was surprised at just how significant Toronto’s contribution is:</p> <p>Although Toronto’s population is just 8% of the country, our non-profit art sector contributes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• 30% of Canada’s earned revenue• 40% of private sector revenue• 38% of the country’s audiences• 25% of Canada’s artists, and• 30% of volunteers <p>Assuming public events are cancelled to end of 2020, the cumulative impact of Toronto’s non profit sector on Toronto will be at least:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• \$183 million lost ticket sales and earned revenue• 25,000 public performances and exhibitions cancelled/postponed
--	--	---

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depriving 20 million people of the joy of connecting directly with artists and artwork in galleries, theatres, and concert halls and other gathering spaces across Toronto <p>And of course, this is all while our artists and arts workers are losing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$145 million in artist and production salaries/fees <p>I do want to reiterate how appreciative we are for the emergency funding provided from the federal government which was so responsive to vulnerable workers. The liquidity through advancements of grants will help. But, I think we all know that, to really enable recovery, other solutions and investments will need to be found.</p> <p>As we all proceed, the board and staff at Toronto Arts Council and Foundation are committed to continuing to work with each of you to help you position Toronto for recovery. We will maintain our values and we will strive very hard to maintain our momentum and try to make gains on equity and inclusion.</p> <p>Where does this leave us? At this time, we don't know if social isolation will end soon, or perhaps continue for many months.</p> <p>We don't know if, when the public is allowed to congregate, whether the response will be reluctant or enthusiastic.</p> <p>We don't know how long it will be before tourists come back to Toronto, but we do know that we will be more effective if we work together to face the challenge.</p> <p>Please contact us any time – I look forward to hearing your needs and concerns and your ideas and suggestions.</p> <p>Thank you again for being with us today.</p>
33:45 - 35:12	Nova Bhattacharya	<p>Thanks Claire. I think we do also know that with leadership like yours and the rest of the panelists, that we can try to work together toward that great new future.</p> <p>Thank you MP Dabrusin, Budget Chief Crawford, Pat and Claire, and David Kolenda.</p>

		<p>We received a number of very thoughtful questions from you, many of which of course were duplicated. We have grouped them into separate topics and will do our best to get through as many as we can.</p> <p>We've ordered these to start with the most popular subject areas.</p> <p>1. The most asked question was about federal funding and support for organizations that currently fall through the cracks. In particular Sheena Robertson asked: "What is being done to advocate for smaller arts organizations? CEBA – the Canadian Emergency Business Account - doesn't apply to us because we do not pay our artists through payroll and the Emergency Support Fund for Cultural Heritage and Sports Organizations doesn't apply to us because we are not already funded by Canada Council or Canadian Heritage?"</p> <p>I'll turn it to MP Julie Dabrusin for a response, and will just add that a number of questions have come in since your statement, requesting a little clarity about what "existing client" means.</p>
<p>35:12 - 38:10</p>	<p>MP Dabrusin</p>	<p>To the existing client piece, I'm going to take a sheet because there's a list so I'm going to read for this one. What it means is that you're a current recipient from Heritage or Canada Council/ when I'm talking about Canadian Heritage it's going to be a top up to the following Arts and Culture programs:</p> <p>Canada Periodical Fund, Canada Book Fund, Canada Music Fund via FACTOR and Music Action, Canada Arts Training Fund, Canada Arts Presentation Fund, Harbourfront Centre Funding Program and Building Communities Through Arts and Heritage Program.</p> <p>Sorry for the piece of paper, but it was a bit of a list. So if you are a recipient of one of those programs or from Canada Council then that is for phase one. But I think it's really important questions about what happens to those organizations who aren't covered through that list. That's where phase two comes in and why I was trying to put the emphasis on phase one being about speed and getting money out within existing programs. But phase two is part of the \$500M and will be to try to get funding to others who</p>

		<p>are not within that recipient group. I will get you those details as they become available.</p> <p>The other part of that question was about the Canada Emergency Bank Account, which is for businesses. There are a few other programs that have been coming out that kind of wrap around a bit more. Most recently, for those who are incorporated, there is the regional development agency funding that was announced yesterday for people who don't qualify for the existing Wage Subsidy or Bank Account. Also, as the Minister mentioned today in the COVID-19 committee - we recognize that there is a lot more to do. This is where the feedback comes in as to where those gaps are and how we can continue to work toward them. The government is focused on this phase right now and on helping get people, particularly the most vulnerable, through this phase and where you can point out those gaps is very helpful to us as we try to meet those needs. Then the next focus is really working toward recovery.</p>
38:10 - 38:30	Nova	<p>Thank you.</p> <p>2. We also received several questions about when and how reopening will be possible. Does the city know when we should expect outdoor public space to reopen for events? And, particularly, will the city consider easing restrictions and fees for events in public spaces?</p> <p>Councillor Crawford – I'll turn this one over to you</p>
38:30 - 42:10	Councillor Crawford	<p>Certainly Nova - I appreciate the question.</p> <p>The opening of Open Spaces really is focused on provincial framework. The best way to describe it is like a dimmer switch which will slowly and gradually be opening up.</p> <p>There are three phases, of which we are now in phase one which is really about protecting and supporting. You're starting to see select workplaces opening up and we have businesses at the curbside opening. The Premier announced today that tennis and golf courses - certain activities where physical distancing can be achieved will be opening up. Also parks, we are looking at slowly opening up parks. This is all based on the Chief Medical Officer of</p>

		<p>Health's recommendations, and I think it's going to be slow unfortunately.</p> <p>In phase 2 a we will be opening up more workplaces and outdoor spaces, allowing more large gatherings. In phase 3 we will be continuing that, but the challenge of course is when. Again it's dependent on a number of critical junctures that we have to meet. Lowering the curve of course is one of them, looking for a consistent 2-4 week decrease in numbers that are coming forth. We are starting to see that in the daily numbers. There is a bit of up and down, but they are pretty much coming down. And also a decrease in cases coming into hospitals. So I think we're starting to see that, but really what's important is the health and safety of workers.</p> <p>The province has been clear that they are working as diligently and hard as they can, but they unfortunately won't be able to say when phase 2 or 3 will be as those are dependent on many other factors that they are not in control of. We may be able to turn on the switch and open up all businesses and all opportunities for gathering, but what we have heard very clearly is that it's all about public confidence. You can open up everything, all the restaurants, theatres and performing arts centres, but until people feel safe to go into them they are not coming. We can look at a slow process, and I think it has to be slow, and I think we have to look at how to build public confidence over a period of time. It's been two months of this and people are getting used to being inside as the current "normal". As people start going out there will be a new normal where they are very conscious of their health and very conscious of the people around them. We have to take that into consideration as we are slowly opening. It's a very balanced approach that the Ontario Government, and other other provinces, will have to take.</p> <p>With regard to fees, being the Budget Chief of Toronto and recognizing that we have our financial challenges, we are looking at different ways that we can change processes. Fees will be one of them. These aren't necessarily big ticket items when we are looking at finances but they are incredibly important to small and large organizations. So we are looking at a number of different ways in fees and processes that we will be able to enable to help support. If you're doing a show, we recognize that time is of the</p>
--	--	--

		<p>essence when you're dealing with permits. So ensuring that you can push through permits very quickly and looking at creative ways to do that as part of the city's obligation or work to support you.</p>
42:10 - 43:05	Nova	<p>Thank you Gary.</p> <p>3. Related to that, David Plant of Trinity Square Video asks - "Has the city considered the conditions that will have to be met before arts venues can open? Has anyone assessed what additional operating costs would be incurred in order to preserve a safe working environment for staff and visitors?" And, another question from Margaret Chasins notes that "one of the greatest challenges will be the gap between box office revenue and fixed costs. With much lower attendance until after a vaccine, will there be a provincial or federal subsidy to performing arts organizations to offset venue costs? And will the City consider a 50% subsidy for TO Live rentals?"</p> <p>Pat, can I throw this to you?</p>
43:05 - 45:15	Pat Tobin	<p>Sure - thanks Nova. I'll take Margaret's question first.</p> <p>PARTICULARLY with performing arts and even in restaurants, you've got high fixed costs and relatively low margins and therefore an inability to change your business model to adjust to varying different public health directions as that dimmer switch of being able to open goes up. So we are very conscious of that. Will there be specific relief in the form that's described? I think we are seeing some of this come from the federal government and we are seeing, as MP Dabrusin said, a willingness to listen to where the gaps are and to try to close those gaps through changes to eligibility criteria. Watching the feed of notes in the chat function here, people please do continue to point out where those limitations are. That is incredibly helpful to all levels.</p> <p>There is also good work that has been mentioned here already by Claire - the two pieces at Ryerson. We are trying to work to develop access to best practices globally which could be applied either to back of house or front of house for performing arts organizations, which would help address the consumer confidence question that Councillor Crawford is pointing out. But principally, this is a public health crisis</p>

		<p>and we will take our direction from public health officials. There are a series of those criteria; the infection rate, healthcare sector capacity and public health infrastructure capacity, that we will continue to watch. Those changes, principally led by the Provincial Emergency orders, will play out and will adjust, but we understand the role that Economic Development and Culture particularly should play in assisting the sector to get access to timely and clear public health direction and assistance on how to apply that in their given business setting here in the culture sector as well. We will be working to play that role by talking to you and talking to Public Health.</p>
<p>45:15 - 45:58</p>	<p>Nova</p>	<p>Thank you, Pat.</p> <p>4. Patty Jarvis has raised a question that I've certainly heard in many conversations I've been in with colleagues. She asks: "As a member of the Toronto Arts Community for 35 years, my greatest fear is that we will strive to return to the way it was and not learn from this experience. Is there, or will there be opportunities through the TAC or the Culture office to strategize together what that future will be? I am particularly interested in the ways that we can and should work collaboratively to deliver programs and offset duplication.</p> <p>Claire – would you like to answer this?</p>
<p>45:58 - 48:48</p>	<p>Claire Hopkinson</p>	<p>I would be delighted - this is one of my favourite topics and it's perfect coming from Patty because Patty and Christine Jackson came to the Toronto Arts Council a number of years ago with an idea for a new collaboration to allow more artists to work in schools and as a result TDSB Creates, a fantastic program, was created. That was partly the new money that came in from the city - thank you Gary - that afforded us the opportunity to fund the TDSB Creates program. Our Open Door program is exactly that kind of program where we are looking to the community to come to us with collaborative ideas. Let us use this opportunity in this crisis to reduce duplication , and backend duplication in particular, to collaborate together. Certainly there is a lot of sharing of information and openness to collaborate. We are not a top-down organization. We are responding to your ideas, so we can have the conversation with you but also we can accept applications from you with these ideas. Whether there will be a more structured program</p>

		<p>than Open Door to come to, is yet to be decided. That's why I was referring earlier to listening to you and wanting your ideas. It is the arts community as we have found time and time again, who are going to come up with imaginative creative solutions that are specific to the size and scale of different operations. You are the ones to know what collaborations are effective and possible. So let us use this time for reflection for many organizations who are not in the hurly burly of opening nights. Let us use this time to reflect and think of how we can resume with better connections, better partnerships, more collaboration, less time wasted on the minutiae that seems to take everyone's time so much. I won't go on, but thanks very much Patty for that question - that is a challenge back to all of you out there.</p>
48:48 - 49:24	Nova	<p>Thanks Claire.</p> <p>5. And, continuing on the subject, Coman Poon also rejects the idea of a "return to normal" and says "We have before us an opportunity to reinvent and innovate and lead in a new way that celebrates human expression. How do we begin to re-imagine this potential future? How do we build a different set of values and conditions for the creation and propagation of art?" In addition other questioners want to know how the community will be invited to give input on planning for the future.</p> <p>Pat & Claire?</p>
49:24 - 52:00	Pat Tobin	<p>I'll start and pass to Claire. I think there's a growing consensus for the people I'm working with, be them Councillors or senior City Staff, that the scale of this challenge doesn't allow for an easy rush back to the status quo. But affords rather an opportunity to try to figure out what a reset might look like. I think you're seeing a shift in language even from "recovery" which might suggest more of a return to the status quo, to things like "rebuild", "reset", and "reimagine". Figuring out what the big pieces are that need to be worked on has been an incredibly useful process with the cultural sector roundtables. We've touched a bit on what people have been asking for. But in one roundtable with youth arts leaders they talked about, from their own client base, a growing sense of hopelessness with respect to job prospects and economic prospects in the creative sector. Certainly that's visceral for them, but they scaled it back out quite quickly to say that the talent pathways in the</p>

		<p>city that have existed for 25 years have fed today into a virtuous cycle where Toronto’s cultural output is known around the world. People want to come here and there are all kinds of important affects of that on our economy and the livability of our city and the diversity model. WQe can’t let that unravel in a rush to restore perhaps what already exists. It’s really important to think forward not just 5 or 10 years but 25 years, and to think about what structural things we can work on now that set us up for success, close the gaps that existed prior to the covid-19 crisis, and are in line with where the arts sector and the rest of the world are going. Toronto has significant ranks that coming out of this I think we can work to shore up and come out stronger having addressed some deficits that have accumulated.</p>
52:00 - 54:00	Claire Hopkinson	<p>Thanks so much for this question. Of course, a lot of us are thinking about this and TAC leaders Lab this particular question has been circulating for a number of years. We have seen great progress over the last few years with an increase in the number of diverse voices afforded opportunity, and the ensuring benefits of that - the fantastic works that have come out of that and have offered us great hope for the future. We are also understanding that wages for artists are abysmally low and how expensive it is to live in Toronto. So when we look at this “reset” or “reimagining” both of these issues really need to be tackled head-on because not only is it about affording opportunity but it has to be a good opportunity. It has to be a sustainable opportunity. We can be a vehicle. We can be a platform for steering some funding through but it is the ideas of how to do this and the gnergy of leadership in the field to make this happen. We need to work together to accomplish this. I’ve been watching the chat room questions which have been fantastic and we will try to answer as many as possible. It is this dialogue that does drive change.</p>
54:00 - 54:30	Nova	<p>Thank you Claire. When you talk about the energy level of the leaders it’s always great to hear you talk about reflection. I think that’s a big concern in the community - that we’ll have to suddenly come up with all the solutions right now. To know that the councils and the City are valuing that we will have to take time to reflect on these issues is important.</p>
54:30 - 55:25	Claire	<p>There is no expectation from Toronto Arts Council, and most likely other councils too, that we are expecting people</p>

		<p>to replicate their artistic product in different forms. If they so choose, and it is a wonderful experiment and expansion of audience engagement, then that is fantastic. But there is this time also to spend time reflecting on the bigger issues as well. I think the flexibility of arts councils in particular to understand that all true ideas and creativity really come from this time of reflection and crisis often. We want to assure you that we understand that this time is necessary to really tackle some of the bigger questions. I wanted to underscore that, so thank you for saying that Nova.</p>
55:25 - 55:50	Nova	<p>6. Finally, a more specific question about digitization. Guillermo Silva-Martin asks if there will be any support or assistance with digitization for small arts organizations with limited capacity?</p> <p>Pat – I think the city has launched a program specifically for that if you would like to respond?</p>
55:50 - 57:20	Pat Tobin	<p>Sure Nova, I'll be brief. First, I've mentioned shopHERE, which is the initiative with Shopify that helps people access ecommerce tools and technical development help to build websites. We will circulate that link. There's capacity to onboard some 30,000 organizations but it will be popular, so I encourage you to take advantage. With MP Dabrusin on the call, it has been great to have a dialogue with the Canada Council for the Arts in respect to the Digital Strategy Fund. Toronto to date has benefitted at 37% of all funds available, which is a good track record. We've been in dialogue about how that fund may adjust to ensure that the pivot people make digitally is sustainable but also drives long term sector adaptation and digital transformation. That is a really active conversation with federal funders, to include how they might consider the eligible categories for their infrastructure programs. There's a lot of good collaboration work like Arts@Home, and digital transformation will also be a pillar in the actual culture sector recovery strategy, and you'll hear more from the city on that in the coming weeks.</p>
57:20 - 58:02	Nova	<p>Thank you Pat, and thank you all for your questions. Thank you MP Dabrusin, Councillor Crawford, Pat Tobin, Claire Hopkinson and David Kolenda. As was the case with the previous webinar – we will be making both the transcript and the recording available and will send the links out to everyone. As Claire mentioned, there will also be an</p>

		attempt to answer the remaining questions that have come in through the chat format. Stay safe, and keep your spirits bright.
--	--	---

Chat Questions

Thank you for all the questions recorded in the chat room. The most frequently asked questions were about the rollout of the federal emergency response fund, most particularly:

- 1) will project grant recipients receive support in the first phase of CCA rollout?
- 2) what is the timeline for phase 2 of the rollout?

We have followed up with Canada Council and have learned that eligible organizations for phase 1 are those that have applied for or been awarded core or project funding in the last three years – April 2017 to 2020. Each of these organizations will be receiving communication from Canada Council directly. The other criteria is that they will need to attest that they have experienced or anticipate a 25% loss of total revenue for a three-month period in 2020 as compared with total revenue for a comparable three-month period in the previous fiscal year.

At the moment, Canada Council does not know if it will be involved in distributing Phase 2 funding or how it will be allocated. Discussions are continuing and information will be sent out as soon as we have it. For additional information please visit:

<https://mailchi.mp/eac3a1899e99/preliminary-results-survey-on-federal-emergency-aid-measures-sondage-sur-les-mesures-fdrales-daide-durgence-rsultats-prliminaires-1043529?e=429919579a>

There were also a number of questions about support for digital presence. There are currently 3 programs announced for which applications are being accepted:

- Digital Originals: <https://canadacouncil.ca/initiatives/digital-originals>
- Digital Strategy Fund: <https://canadacouncil.ca/funding/strategic-funds/digital-strategy-fund>
- ShopHERE: <https://digitalmainstreet.ca/shophere/>

Finally, there were a number of requests for support, for which there are not yet responses. TAC is adding these to our advocacy messaging:

- Support is needed for organizations who pay staff and artists on contract

- support is needed for increased production and performance costs due to covid-19
- it is going to be essential to extend CERB past June

To view the video of this Digital Update, please click here: <https://youtu.be/8qZX1Zgkuks>